

Access to the Baccalaureate Degree

Frank Goldberg
Associate Vice President
Office of Policy Analysis and Research

Board of Regents Meeting
Madison, Wisconsin
December 4, 2003

The objective of this presentation is to examine how access to the baccalaureate is provided in Wisconsin and the surrounding states. Access to the baccalaureate means more than just access to higher educational institutions – it means access to and competition of a bachelors degree.

Percent of Population Ages 25 Years and Over with a Bachelor's or Higher Degree

State	1980		1990		2000		2002	
	%	Rnk	%	Rnk	%	Rnk	%	Rnk
Illinois	16.2%	25	21.0%	20	26.1%	16	28.1%	14
Indiana	12.5%	46	15.6%	46	19.4%	44	20.6%	45
Iowa	13.9%	38	16.9%	41	21.2%	39	22.2%	40
Michigan	14.3%	36	17.4%	38	21.8%	35	23.6%	33
Minnesota	17.4%	21	21.8%	16	27.4%	11	29.8%	10
Wisconsin	14.8%	31	17.7%	35	22.4%	30	23.2%	37
U.S.	16.2%	n/a	20.3%	n/a	24.4%	n/a	25.9%	n/a

Source: U.S. Census Bureau.

- Many of you have seen these data before as David J. Ward has been talking about them for several years.
- The proportion of the population with a bachelor's degree nationally and in the region has increased steadily since 1980.
- The proportion of bachelor's degree holders in Wisconsin has lagged behind Minnesota and Illinois and is below the national average.
- My thesis is that increasing the proportion of Wisconsin residents with a bachelor's degree or higher, and reaping the benefits both to the state and its citizens, is a complex matter and cannot be achieved by any single policy or action – there is no “silver bullet.”

Public High School Graduation Rates

State	1986		1990		2000		2001	
	Rate	Rnk	Rate	Rnk	Rate	Rnk	Rate	Rnk
Illinois	77.9%	21	76.6%	23	71.1%	25	70.9%	27
Indiana	76.2%	25	75.0%	24	68.2%	33	67.9%	33
Iowa	87.3%	4	87.6%	3	83.0%	6	82.8%	4
Michigan	74.3%	33	70.1%	34	68.7%	32	74.7%	16
Minnesota	88.7%	1	89.8%	1	83.7%	5	82.3%	5
Wisconsin	84.6%	8	84.2%	7	78.0%	9	78.2%	7
U.S.	73.4%		71.2%		67.1%		67.3%	

Rate equals public high school graduates as a percentage of public 9th grade enrollment four years earlier.

Source: *Postsecondary Education OPPORTUNITY*, and National Center for Education Statistics (NCES).

- States in the region have high school graduation rates that exceed the national average.
- High high school graduation rates provide an opportunity in the sense that it provides a large base, relative to the population, who are potentially eligible to earn a bachelor's degree.
- High high school graduation rates also provide a challenge in the sense that it creates high demand for higher education, which must be met.

Change in Public High School Graduates

State	Actual		Projected		
	1987 to 1994	1994 to 2001	2001 to 2008	2008 to 2013	2001 to 2013
Illinois	-12.0%	8.3%	18.0%	-0.4%	17.5%
Indiana	-9.5%	2.8%	7.5%	-2.6%	4.8%
Iowa	-12.5%	11.7%	2.4%	-9.5%	-7.3%
Michigan	-18.8%	15.7%	36.2%	-7.5%	25.9%
Minnesota	-11.2%	19.1%	6.1%	-9.4%	-3.9%
Wisconsin	-14.9%	22.7%	4.2%	-9.8%	-6.0%
U.S.	-8.6%	15.7%	14.1%	-3.0%	10.7%

Source: Projections of Education Statistics to 2013, National Center for Education Statistics (NCES).
(Actual changes from 1987 to 2001 include data reported in earlier publications.)

- From 1987 to 2001, the number of high school graduates in Wisconsin declined and then increased more precipitously than other states in the region.
- From 2001 to 2012 the number of high school graduates in Wisconsin is projected to first increase more slowly than other states in the region and nationally and then decline more steeply.
- The demographics in Wisconsin, as Dr. Finney suggested this morning, provide an opportunity in that relatively stable population does not require expansion of the higher education enterprise just to accommodate the population growth and allows Wisconsin to focus on increasing participation rates.

College Participation Rates of Immediate New Freshmen Fall 2001

	IL	IN	IA	MI	MN	WI
Enrolled in Higher Ed	57.7%	57.4%	63.7%	56.7%	60.3%	56.9%
Enrolled In-State	44.3%	49.7%	54.7%	51.2%	45.7%	46.4%
Public 4-year	16.1%	34.9%	20.3%	27.4%	17.5%	27.6%
Private	10.0%	9.5%	10.8%	8.4%	9.4%	6.1%
Public 2-year	18.2%	5.2%	23.6%	15.4%	18.7%	12.8%
Enrolled Out-of-State	13.4%	7.5%	9.0%	5.5%	14.7%	10.6%
Not Enrolled	42.5%	42.6%	36.3%	43.3%	39.7%	43.1%

Source: National Center for Education Statistics (NCES).

Wisconsin and other states in the region lag behind Iowa and Minnesota in overall college participation rates, i.e., the proportion of high school graduates who enroll in higher education immediately after high school graduation – the first row in the table.

- Wisconsin ranks second in the region, lagging behind only Indiana, in participation in the public 4-year sector.
- Iowa and Minnesota, along with Illinois, have lower participation rates in the public 4-year sector.
- Iowa achieves its high overall participation rate by relying on the public 2-year sector.
- Minnesota and Illinois, rely on a combination of the public 2-year sector and out-of-state enrollment to offset lower participation in the public 4-year sector.

Net Migration of Immediate New Freshmen Fall 2002

	IL	IN	IA	MI	MN	WI
In-Migration	7,501	10,944	7,114	3,767	7,128	7,098
Out-Migration	19,219	4,754	3,087	6,567	10,021	7,136
Net Migration	-11,718	6,190	4,027	-2,800	-2,893	-38
Net Migration Rate	-15.3%	16.2%	16.9%	-4.8%	-7.2%	-0.1%

Net migration rate is the net migration divided by the domestic immediate new freshman enrollment in each state. International students are not included, but make up less than 2% of enrolled freshmen in these states.
Note: 3,187 students from WI attended school in MN, while 2,908 students from MN attend in WI.

Source: National Center for Education Statistics (NCES).

- Another way of seeing the reliance of Illinois and Minnesota on out-of-state enrollment is to look at the net migration rate, i.e., net migration as a proportion of the high school graduates in the state.

Population Adjusted Undergraduate Enrollment

State	1986		2002		Change 1986 to 2002
	Number	Rank	Number	Rank	
Illinois	243,724	2	289,136	4	18.6%
Indiana	161,218	6	267,757	6	66.1%
Iowa	224,390	5	313,565	1	39.7%
Michigan	229,472	4	280,277	5	22.1%
Minnesota	232,749	3	293,838	2	26.2%
Wisconsin	251,851	1	292,747	3	16.2%

Enrollment numbers are adjusted for population to assist comparability among states. Values for each state are multiplied by the ratio of the population ages 18 to 24 in Wisconsin relative to the population ages 18 to 24 in that state.

Source: National Center for Education Statistics (NCES) and U.S. Census Bureau.

Next we turn our attention to total enrollment in higher education in the states within the region – these data and data in subsequent tables are adjusted for differences in state population.

- In 1986, Wisconsin ranked first in the region in undergraduate enrollment.
- By 2001, Iowa and Minnesota had surpassed Wisconsin in enrollment.

Distribution of Undergraduate Enrollment 1986

	IL	IN	IA	MI	MN	WI
Public 4-yr	25.8%	56.8%	42.3%	40.9%	54.8%	51.5%
Private	19.0%	26.6%	30.3%	13.1%	20.6%	12.7%
Public 2-yr	55.2%	16.6%	27.4%	46.1%	24.6%	35.8%
Total %	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%

UW Colleges and WTCS are included under Public 2-years for comparability with other states.

Source: National Center for Education Statistics (NCES).

Looking at how students are distributed across educational sectors provides insight into how states in the region serve students.

- In 1986, Wisconsin, like Minnesota and Indiana had the majority of its in-state enrollments in the public 4-year sector. In contrast to the other states, Wisconsin had the smallest percentage of their students enrolled in private institutions.
- Illinois and Michigan had large public 2-year sectors and Iowa relied on a combination of the public 2-year sector and a relatively large private sector.

Distribution of Undergraduate Enrollment 2002

	IL	IN	IA	MI	MN	WI
Public 4-yr	22.8%	54.6%	31.1%	42.3%	37.8%	43.4%
Private	22.9%	25.0%	27.7%	17.2%	21.8%	16.5%
Public 2-yr	54.3%	20.4%	41.2%	40.5%	40.4%	40.1%
Total %	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%

UW Colleges and WTCS are included under Public 2-years for comparability with other states.

Source: National Center for Education Statistics (NCES).

This is a parallel chart to the one you have just seen – now focusing on 2002.

- By 2002, the balance had shifted in Wisconsin and Minnesota, so that the public 4-year sector no longer had the majority of enrollments.
- In Wisconsin this was due to growth of the public 2-year sector, accompanied by relative stability in the public 4-year sector.
- In Minnesota this was the result of a doubling of enrollment in the public 2-year sector and a decline in public 4-year enrollments.
- Indiana and Iowa also doubled enrollment in their public 2-year sectors between 1986 and 2002. At the same time, Indiana also increased its public 4-year sector by almost 60%.

Percent of Undergraduates Enrolled Full-time 2002

	IL	IN	IA	MI	MN	WI
Public 4-yr	86.0%	76.3%	89.6%	79.6%	77.0%	87.2%
Private	79.2%	80.8%	80.0%	66.0%	84.4%	78.8%
Public 2-yr	34.0%	36.7%	52.0%	31.2%	48.5%	34.1%

Source: National Center for Education Statistics (NCES).

Another dimension of access to the baccalaureate, which we have heard considerable amount about in recent years, is service to non-traditional students.

- While identifying “non-traditional” students is complex and entails both demographic and behavioral factors, the two most frequently used measures are full-time/part-time status and age.
- Public 4-year institutions in the region primarily serve full-time students.
- Since 1986 there has been an increase in the proportion of students in the public 4-year sector who are enrolled full-time in all states in the region
- Complete age data for all sectors are not available. However, for the 4-year sector, there has also been a decline since 1986 in the proportion of non-traditional age students enrolled in public 4-year institutions in all states in the region
- In the public 2-year sector, Iowa and Minnesota, the two states with the largest growth in the 2-year sector since 1986 have almost half of their students enrolled full-time.
- In the UW System, since 1986, access for traditional students has been protected and, at the same time, the UW System has underserved non-traditional students.

Total* Undergraduate Need-based Grants (million \$) Adjusted for Wisconsin 18 to 24 Population

State	1986-87	1990-91	2000-01	2001-02
Illinois	\$56.0	\$77.5	\$154.8	\$165.6
Indiana	\$26.2	\$39.6	\$93.3	\$97.2
Iowa	\$38.9	\$64.3	\$91.9	\$97.2
Michigan	\$34.1	\$35.1	\$57.1	\$57.8
Minnesota	\$75.6	\$86.4	\$133.3	\$141.5
Wisconsin	\$30.6	\$42.4	\$65.6	\$62.1
U.S.	\$26.7	\$31.8	\$66.8	\$73.1

*Includes both general and categorical programs.

Grant dollars are adjusted for population to assist comparability among states. Values for each state are multiplied by the ratio of the population ages 18 to 24 in Wisconsin relative to the population ages 18 to 24 in that state.

Source: National Association of State Student Grant and Aid Programs (NASSGAP).

- Another factor that affects baccalaureate degree production is the availability of need-based grant aid provided by the state. There was considerable discussion of this issue this morning, so I won't dwell on it now.
- However, as we saw, this morning, Wisconsin has a modest need-based grant program, ranking below all other states in the region except for MI and falling below the national average.

Population Adjusted Baccalaureate Degrees Awarded 1986-87

State	Public		Private		Total	
	Number	Rank	Number	Rank	Number	Rank
Illinois	11,948	6	7,859	2	19,807	5
Indiana	15,744	3	6,963	4	22,707	4
Iowa	16,637	2	10,682	1	27,319	1
Michigan	14,976	5	3,847	6	18,823	6
Minnesota	15,504	4	7,747	3	23,251	3
Wisconsin	19,349	1	5,089	5	24,438	2

Source: National Center for Education Statistics (NCES).

Next, we focus on the objective of the access, i.e., the attainment of the bachelor's degree.

As we did with enrollment, we focus first on 1986.

- In 1986, Wisconsin ranked first in the region in baccalaureate degrees awarded by public universities and second, behind Iowa, in total degrees. Note that the overall rank is, in part, a reflection of the relatively small private sector; Wisconsin, on a population adjusted basis, trails all states in the region except for Michigan.

Population Adjusted Baccalaureate Degrees Awarded 2001-02

State	Public		Private		Total	
	Number	Rank	Number	Rank	Number	Rank
Illinois	14,124	6	11,580	2	25,704	6
Indiana	20,246	2	10,127	4	30,373	2
Iowa	18,085	4	15,740	1	33,825	1
Michigan	19,545	3	6,633	6	26,178	5
Minnesota	16,425	5	10,191	3	26,616	4
Wisconsin	21,304	1	7,479	5	28,783	3

Source: National Center for Education Statistics (NCES).

Now, turning attention to 2001.

- In 2001, Wisconsin continued to lead the region in bachelor's degrees awarded in the public sector, but fell to third behind Iowa, which had substantial growth in degrees produced by the private sector, and Indiana, which also had a large increase in the private sector accompanied by a smaller, but significant, growth in degrees produced by the public sector.

Enrollment and Degree Growth 1986 to 2001

State	Enrollment			Baccalaureate Degrees		
	Public 4-year	Private	Public 2-year	Public	Private	Total
Indiana	+59%	+57%	+104%	+28.5%	+45.4%	+33.8%
Iowa	+3%	+28%	+110%	+8.7%	+47.4%	+23.8%
Minnesota	-13%	+34%	+107%	+5.9%	+31.5%	+14.1%
Wisconsin	-2%	+51%	+30%	+10.1%	+46.9%	+17.7%

This slide focuses on the three states that had the largest growth in enrollment between 1986 and 2001 compared with the experience in Wisconsin.

- Overall, Indiana increased enrollment by 66%, Iowa by 40% and Minnesota by 26%. (These numbers are not on the slide.)
- In Indiana, where there was enrollment growth in all three sectors, the largest coming in the public 2-year sector, there was corresponding growth in degrees produced by all three sectors.
- In Iowa, the enrollment growth was confined to the private and 2-year sectors. Correspondingly substantial growth occurred in degrees produced in the private sector.
- Minnesota had experiences similar to Iowa, differing only in that the growth in enrollment in the 2-year sector was accompanied by a decline in enrollment in the public 4-year sector. Again, the growth in degrees was primarily in the private sector.

What we can learn from the experience of our neighbors is that growth in the 2-year sector won't necessarily result in growth of degrees produced by the public 4-year sector. The way the growth in the 2-year sector takes place and the way it interfaces with the 4-year sector will determine whether or not growth in the 2-year sector will result in an increase in bachelor's degrees.

Migration of the Young, Single and College-Educated

State	In-migration (Attracting)	Out-migration (Retaining)	Net Migration
	1995 to 2000	1995 to 2000	1995 to 2000
Illinois	22.4%	21.2%	1.2%
Indiana	17.3%	31.5%	-14.2%
Iowa	17.1%	39.1%	-22.0%
Michigan	14.4%	23.1%	-8.7%
Minnesota	23.2%	21.6%	1.6%
Wisconsin	16.3%	27.1%	-10.8%

This table reports domestic migration only; migration to and from other countries or US territories is not included.

Source: "Migration of the Young, Single, and College-Educated: 1995 to 2000," US Census Bureau.

The proportion of the population in a state with a bachelor's degree or higher is not just a result of degrees produced. In-migration and out-migration of college educated persons also has an impact.

- Illinois and Minnesota are the only states in the region that have a positive net in-migration of Young Single College Educated (YSCEs), which means that more of these individuals moved into Illinois and Minnesota than moved out.
- Wisconsin's net migration of YSCEs falls below all but Indiana and Iowa.
- While Wisconsin loses somewhat more YSCEs than Illinois, Minnesota and Michigan it still ranks in the top half of all states in retaining its graduates.
- Where Wisconsin lags is in attracting YSCEs, falling behind all other states in the region except Michigan and ranking in the lowest quartile of states nationally.
- Our ability to increase the attractiveness of Wisconsin as a destination for YSCEs would/could substantially reverse the "brain drain" and help increase the proportion of the Wisconsin population with a bachelor's degree.

Conclusions

- Public 4-year institutions are the primary source of bachelors degrees in Wisconsin
- Wisconsin has been meeting the needs of traditional students but has not done as well in serving nontraditional populations
- The demographics provide an opportunity to expand access to underserved populations
- Need based financial aid plays an important role in providing access to the baccalaureate
- There are multiple ways that access to a baccalaureate degree can be provided
- Producing more baccalaureate degrees is a necessary but not sufficient condition

What does all this mean for Wisconsin – as I indicated at the outset – there is no “silver bullet.”

1. Wisconsin has a relatively small private sector and, therefore, it relies heavily on the UW for producing bachelor’s degree graduates.
2. During enrollment management declines 1986-1994 and during growth period of enrollment management 1995-present, access for traditional age students was protected. At the same time, there was a decline in the number of non-traditional students served.
3. Wisconsin will not be facing demographic pressures.
4. As we saw this morning, state need-based aid matters.
5. As we saw from the experience of our neighbors, expansion of the public 2-year sector may or may not result in increased degree production. It depends on how that growth is managed.
6. Supply may not create its own demand. In order to attract college graduates to Wisconsin, jobs must be available. Increasing degree production and state economic development goes hand-in-hand.

Policy Options - Programmatic

- Improve transfer between two-year and four-year institutions.
- Expand associate degree programs on 4-year campuses.
- Expand/Develop Collaborations:
 - UW Colleges-UW four-year institutions-UW Extension
 - UW Colleges and WTCS institutions
 - UW four-year institutions, UW Extension and WTCS institutions
- Expand access to on-line course delivery.

Policy Options - Structural

- Develop joint associate degree programs:
 - ✦ UW Colleges and WTCS institutions
 - ✦ UW Colleges, UW Extension and UW four-year institutions
- Expand Technical College Mission.
- Develop a community college system by merging the UW Colleges and WTCS.

Policy Options – Financial

- Restore State Support for Public Higher Education (both two- and four-year).
- Expand Need-based Grant Program.
- Provide Financial Incentives for Graduates to Remain in Wisconsin.
- Provide Financial Incentives to Attract Students to Wisconsin.